Fair Grading and Effective Feedback

Olivia Harper Wilkins, G5, Chemistry
By the end of this session, you will be able to:

- Differentiate between effective and ineffective grading and feedback
- Communicate clear expectations to students
- Grade consistently and fairly
- Provide efficient and effective feedback for students
By the end of this session, you will be able to:

- Differentiate between effective and ineffective grading and feedback
- Communicate clear expectations to students
- Grade consistently and fairly
- Provide efficient and effective feedback for students
Reflecting on your own experiences

Pause and reflect

What are some ways, as a student or instructor, that you’ve experienced effective feedback?

What about ineffective feedback?
Reflecting on your own experiences

Effective feedback
- Areas for improvement clear
- Diagnosing origin of error(s) / deconstructing problems
- Positive reinforcement
- Make students feel encouraged
- Timely

Ineffective feedback
- Just “No,” “See solutions,” or “What were you thinking?”
- Illegible writing
- Scores on rubrics with no rationale
- Too many comments = overwhelming
- Difficult to decipher tone
By the end of this session, you will be able to:

- Differentiate between effective and ineffective grading and feedback
- Communicate clear expectations to students
- Grade consistently and fairly
- Provide efficient and effective feedback for students
Assignment: Write a full report on experiment 1. Include an abstract, introduction, methods, results and discussion, and conclusion. You will be graded out of 100 points. Due Friday.
Assignment: Write a full report on experiment 1. Include an abstract, introduction, methods, results and discussion, and conclusion. You will be graded out of 100 points. Due Friday.

- What does a report entail in terms of formality, writing style, and general structure?
Assignment: Write a full report on experiment 1. Include an abstract, introduction, methods, results and discussion, and conclusion. You will be graded out of 100 points. Due Friday.

- What does a report entail in terms of formality, writing style, and general structure?
- What types of information go into each section?
Assignment: Write a full report on experiment 1. Include an abstract, introduction, methods, results and discussion, and conclusion. You will be graded out of 100 points. Due Friday.

- What does a report entail in terms of formality, writing style, and general structure?
- What types of information go into each section?
- How will points be allotted? How should students prioritize their time?
Communication clear expectations

Pause and reflect

Assignment: Write a full report on experiment 1. Include an abstract, introduction, methods, results and discussion, and conclusion. You will be graded out of 100 points. Due Friday.

How might we improve this assignment description?
Communicating clear expectations

- **Transparent teaching** has been shown to significantly improve student learning and grades.
Transparent teaching has been shown to significantly improve student learning and grades.

In designing assignments, communicate the following:

- **Purpose of the assignment**
  - What skills will/should students practice?
  - What knowledge will students gain?
Transparent teaching has been shown to significantly improve student learning and grades.

In designing assignments, communicate the following:

- **Purpose of the assignment**
- **Task(s) at hand**
  - What are students actually doing?
  - What steps should be followed?
  - Is there a specific format or workflow that should be employed?
Transparent teaching has been shown to significantly improve student learning and grades.

In designing assignments, communicate the following:

- **Purpose of the assignment**
- **Task(s) at hand**
- **Criteria for success**
  - What does excellence look like?
  - Share examples of “good” work e.g. answer keys for similar problems, sample lab reports, sample presentations
  - List expectations so they can focus on higher order concerns like content and understanding
By the end of this session, you will be able to:

- Differentiate between effective and ineffective grading and feedback
- Communicate clear expectations to students
- Grade consistently and fairly
- Provide efficient and effective feedback for students
Question: Find $y$ for $x = 3$ when $4y = 3x - 1$ (4 points)

Answer: $y = 2$

Student 1: $y = 2$

Student 2: $y = 2$ (code attached)

Student 3:

$4y = 3(3) - 1$
$4y = 9 - 1$
$4y = 8$
$y = 32$

Student 4: 

![Graph showing the linear relationship between x and y]
Question: Find $y$ for $x = 3$ when $4y = 3x - 1$ (4 points)

Answer: $y = 2$

Student 1:
$y = 2$

Student 3:
$4y = 3(3) - 1$
$4y = 9 - 1$
$4y = 8$
$y = 32$

How would you grade these responses?

Go to https://forms.gle/zwhc3MqvkfQhsCtcA or scan the QR code:
Question: Find \( y \) for \( x = 3 \) when \( 4y = 3x - 1 \) (4 points)

Answer: \( y = 2 \)

Grading exercise

Pause and reflect

Student 1: \( y = 2 \)

Student 2: \( y = 2 \) (code attached)

Student 3: \( 4y = 3(3) - 1; 4y = 9 - 1; 4y = 8 \) \( y = \frac{8}{4} = 2 \)

Student 4: 

Initial distribution of points assigned (n = 17)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Student 1</th>
<th>Student 2</th>
<th>Student 3</th>
<th>Student 4</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

[Insert sample distribution before recording]

Grading exercise
Question: Find $y$ for $x = 3$ when $4y = 3x − 1$ (4 points)

Answer: $y = 2$

Student 1: $y=2$

Student 2: $y=2$ (code attached)

Student 3: $4y=3(3)−1$
$4y=9−1$
$4y=8$
$y=32$

Student 4: $y=\frac{3x−1}{4}$

Student 4's answer is correct, but the student did not show their work. A rubric could be used to grade this exercise.

How would your grading change if you had been given this rubric?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Criterion</th>
<th>Points</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Answers question</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Correct answer</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shows work</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quality and clarity of work</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Rubrics – a tool for consistent grading

For the student

- If given before due date: help students focus on important content

- If returned with graded assignment: break down areas of improvement in organized manner

- Benefits (according to education research):
  - Increased grades
  - Increased class participation
  - Enhanced understanding of material
Rubrics – a tool for consistent grading

For the student
▪ If given before due date: help students focus on important content
▪ If returned with graded assignment: break down areas of improvement in organized manner
▪ Benefits (according to education research):
  ▪ Increased grades
  ▪ Increased class participation
  ▪ Enhanced understanding of material

For the instructor/TA
▪ Consistent and reliable grading over time and with multiple graders
▪ Faster, less-stressful grading
Rubrics – design

Select criteria

Develop scale

Assign points
Consider the **purpose** of the assignment
Think of content and style **categories**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Criterion</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Eye contact</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Rubrics – design

- Split criteria into levels
  - **Binary**: yes/no, present/absent; objective
  - **Multi-level**: more detailed; subjective

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Criterion</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Eye contact</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
- Split criteria into levels
  - **Binary**: yes/no, present/absent; objective
  - **Multi-level**: more detailed; subjective

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Criterion</th>
<th>No eye contact, read directly from slides</th>
<th>Minimal eye contact, mostly read slides</th>
<th>Eye contact with 1-2 people, some slide reading</th>
<th>Eye contact with multiple people throughout</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Eye contact</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Rubrics – design

Select criteria | Develop scale | Assign points
---|---|---
- Assign points for each level  
- Do not need to distribute evenly  
- More important criteria = more points

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Criterion</th>
<th>No eye contact, read directly from slides</th>
<th>Minimal eye contact, mostly read slides</th>
<th>Eye contact with 1-2 people, some slide reading</th>
<th>Eye contact with multiple people throughout</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Eye contact</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Assign points for each level
Do not need to distribute evenly
More important criteria = more points

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Criterion</th>
<th>0 points</th>
<th>1 point</th>
<th>2 points</th>
<th>3 points</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Eye contact</td>
<td>No eye contact, read directly from slides</td>
<td>Minimal eye contact, mostly read slides</td>
<td>Eye contact with 1-2 people, some slide reading</td>
<td>Eye contact with multiple people throughout</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Develop part of a rubric for an assignment you might use in a class.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Criterion</th>
<th>0 points</th>
<th>1 point</th>
<th>2 points</th>
<th>3 points</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Eye contact</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Rubrics – tips for grading

- Revise your rubric after grading the first few assignments, if necessary.
- Aim to spend equal time on each piece of work.
- Grade a single problem across all assignments instead of grading each assignment in series.
- Use the rubric as a marking tool and return it to students with the graded assignment.
- Take breaks so you make fewer mistakes!
By the end of this session, you will be able to:

- Differentiate between effective and ineffective grading and feedback
- Communicate clear expectations to students
- Grade consistently and fairly
- Provide efficient and effective feedback for students
Effective feedback – what is it?

- Understandable and accessible
  - Quantity: enough to be useful, not too much that it’s overwhelming
  - Quality: legible, coherent, marking key (especially for writing)
Effective feedback – what is it?

- Understandable and accessible
  - Quantity: enough to be useful, not too much that it’s overwhelming
  - Quality: legible, coherent, marking key (especially for writing)

- Constructive
  - Balance positive and negative
  - Focus on the action, not the person
Effective feedback – what is it?

- Understandable and accessible
  - Quantity: enough to be useful, not too much that it’s overwhelming
  - Quality: legible, coherent, marking key (especially for writing)

- Constructive
  - Balance positive and negative
  - Focus on the action, not the person

- Can be usefully incorporated
  - Timeliness
  - Directs future effort
### Rubrics

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Criterion</th>
<th>0 pt</th>
<th>1 pt</th>
<th>2 pt</th>
<th>3 pt</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Eye Contact</td>
<td>No eye contact, reading directly from slides</td>
<td>Minimal eye contact, mostly reading slides</td>
<td>Eye contact with 1-2 people, some reading slides</td>
<td>Eye contact with multiple people throughout</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- [ ]
- [ ]
- [ ]
- [ ]
Effective feedback – methods

Rubrics

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Criterion</th>
<th>0 pt</th>
<th>1 pt</th>
<th>2 pt</th>
<th>3 pt</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Eye Contact</td>
<td>No eye contact, reading directly from slides</td>
<td>Minimal eye contact, mostly reading slides</td>
<td>Eye contact with 1-2 people, some reading slides</td>
<td>Eye contact with multiple people throughout</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Model answers

Answer the following algebra problems. Show your work, as in the example below:

Example Question:
Find \( y \) for \( x=5 \) when \( 3y=3x-6 \)

Example Answer:
\[
3y = 3(5) - 6 \\
3y = 15 - 6 \\
3y = 9 \\
y = 3
\]
Effective feedback – methods

- Rubrics
  
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Criterion</th>
<th>0 pt</th>
<th>1 pt</th>
<th>2 pt</th>
<th>3 pt</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Eye Contact</td>
<td>No eye contact, reading directly from slides</td>
<td>Minimal eye contact, mostly reading slides</td>
<td>Eye contact with 1-2 people, some reading slides</td>
<td>Eye contact with multiple people throughout</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Model answers
  
Answer the following algebra problems. Show your work, as in the example below:

**Example Question:**
Find $y$ for $x=5$ when $3y=3x-6$

**Example Answer:**

$3y = 3(5) - 6$

$3y = 15 - 6$

$3y = 9$

$y = 3$

- Shorthand guide

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TA’s Shorthand Guide</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>SW</strong> = Show Work</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Alg</strong> = Algebra error</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>CN</strong> = Citation Needed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>SP</strong> = Spelling Error</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Effective feedback – methods

Rubrics

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Criterion</th>
<th>0 pt</th>
<th>1 pt</th>
<th>2 pt</th>
<th>3 pt</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Eye Contact</td>
<td>No eye contact, reading directly from slides</td>
<td>Minimal eye contact, mostly reading slides</td>
<td>Eye contact with 1-2 people</td>
<td>Eye contact with multiple people throughout</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Model answers

Answer the following algebra problems. Show your work, as in the example below:

Example Question:
Find \( y \) for \( x=5 \) when \( 3y=3x-6 \)

Example Answer:
\[
3y = 3(5) - 6 \\
3y = 15 - 6 \\
3y = 9 \\
y = 3
\]

Directed feedback

Ishmael Aziz
Lab Report #2

Ishmael –
Overall, this was a good improvement from report #1! The main things for you to work on are formatting figures and working on voice/tense in writing. It looks like you have a good understanding of the science. Please see me in my office hours if you have questions!

In this lab experiment, I had an unknown acid and I
In this lab experiment, I had an unknown acid and I

Overall, this was a good improvement from report #1! The main things for you to work on are formatting figures and working on voice/tense in writing. It looks like you have a good understanding of the science. Please see me in my office hours if you have questions!

Hi everyone!

I noticed some common mistakes in the last report, so here are some general comments to consider on your upcoming report.

When writing a lab report, you should use a third person voice:

1st: We dissolved 5.00g KMnO₄ in 20.00 mL water and stirred for 2 hours. (Incorrect)

2nd: Dissolve 5.00g KMnO₄ in 20.00 mL water and stir for 2 hours. (Incorrect)

3rd: 5.00g KMnO₄ was dissolved in 20.00 mL water and stirred for 2 hours. (Correct!)
Think back to the grading exercise we did earlier...

- Would you only provide a raw score?
- Would you correct students’ mistakes or indicate where they went wrong?
- How would you indicate what was wrong? A circle around the mistake? Strikethrough?
- Would you leave any written comments explaining the issue in more detail?
- If your answers to these questions depends on the situation, what factors would go into how you approach grading?

Question: Find $y$ for $x = 3$ when $4y = 3x - 1$ (4 points)

Answer: $y = 2$
Common questions and challenges

- “How will this be graded?”
- “My answer is correct; why didn’t I get full points?” (no work shown)
- “I think I should have gotten points for this!” (partially correct answer)
- “My friend didn’t lose points for this!” “I didn’t lose points last time!”
- “Am I allowed to use the Internet (or other resources) on this assignment?”
- “I didn’t understand what I was supposed to do.”
- “Can I still get an A in the class? How badly will this hurt my final grade?”
Best practices

- Communicate clear expectations.
- Be consistent in grading (e.g. use rubrics).
- Give constructive and informative feedback.
Next Steps

- Please visit https://teach.caltech.edu for more resources on teaching remotely

- Visit https://learn.caltech.edu for more resources on learning remotely